

**PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT
MARCH 13, 2002**

ZONING MAP AMENDMENT/PRELIMINARY DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Applicant: Church of Latter Day Saints
Location: East Side of Liberty Street between Ashmoore Drive and Liberty Ridge Avenue
Present Zoning: FR, Farm Residential (Liberty Township Zoning)
Proposed Zoning: PR, Planned Residence District
Request: Approval of a Preliminary Development Plan for a Proposed 12,800 sq. ft. Church on 5.01 Acres and Proposed Zoning Map Amendment from FR, Farm Residential (Liberty Township Zoning) to PR, Planned Residence District

Although approved to submit a Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan, Staff incorrectly informed the applicant of the submittal deadline for public notification. The deadline for a development plan, regardless of preliminary, final, or combined, is 10 days and 15 days for a Zoning Map amendment. Staff used the 10 day requirement as the deadline. The applicant would not have been able to meet the 15 day requirement. Also, with three new Commission members it is best this proposal have an additional review.

At the Sketch Plan review the square footage of the building was not the primary concern but rather how the building was massed. Staff spent a considerable amount of time on this issue. However, after meeting with Emil Slavik it was determined that the best way to manage the massing of this building is to direct our attention to the details of the architecture rather than the overall mass.

Churches typically are, and have been, one of largest buildings in a given municipal area. Generally, they are also one of the more elaborate buildings and often surrounded by residential properties. This is true in the neighborhoods of Columbus and the surrounding suburbs. In the German Village there is Saint Mary's Catholic (built circa 1850), Saint Christopher Catholic in Grandview (built 1947) and in Liberty Township Saint Joan of Arc Catholic (built 1987). While over time the architectural styles have changed, the space needs and attention to detail have not. The attention should be on the architectural details for this project. Staff will defer their architectural comments to Mr. Slavik.

The applicant has added a lime stone treatment to the left and right sides of the front elevation. This does help soften the brick wall. Based on photographs of the London, Ohio church, Staff is concerned with the reveal shown. In plan view the stone appears to be clearly separate pieces accented by the grid of shadow lines. However, in reality these lines are very faint. Staff recommends the applicant make the reveal a more dominant feature.

Staff recommends the HVAC vents shown on the front elevation be moved elsewhere, preferably a side elevation and lower on the façade where screening is possible. Also, Staff recommends the applicant remove the fence screening the mechanicals on the side elevations and replace it with a brick wall. This will be less intrusive and will blend better with the building. Ivy could be planted around the wall for better screening.

The accessory building is drawn incorrectly. The brick wall shown to be screening the satellite dish is shown on the wrong elevation. Staff is concerned with the ability of the brick wall and associated plantings to screen the satellite dish. The dish is believed to be 12 feet in diameter, with a mounting height of about 15 feet to the top of the dish; this places the top of the dish 3 feet above the top of the accessory building. Also, the wall does not enclose the dish. The dish will be clearly visible from the north (Ashmoore) and east (Liberty Ridge) sides. The applicant should provide detailed information, including elevations with the dish shown, regarding this concern.

The applicant was also requested to investigate the possibility of using a smaller dish. Staff has not been informed if this is possible.

Additionally, the applicant has not shown any details for the dumpster screening. At the Sketch Plan, Staff requested the applicant investigate using roll-out containers. If roll-out containers can be used instead of the dumpster, Staff would support making the accessory building larger to allow for container storage.

Overall, the site plan has changed little since the Sketch Plan. The applicant has centered the development on the property to maximize the green space between both Ashmoore and Liberty Ridge. Section 1145.15 requires a 40 feet setback of non-residential uses from residential districts. With proper landscaping, this requirement can be reduced up to 50%, 20 feet. The applicant is requesting to reduce the 40 feet setback to 32 feet (north) and 37 feet (south). Landscaping has been shown on both sides where the landscaping is required, however the applicant was asked to use a combination of mounding and landscaping. Mounding (approximately 3 feet in height) has been shown on the south and east property line. Staff feels the mounding appears to be too engineered and recommends the applicant use a variety of shaped mounds, or a serpentine mound, with breaks in the mounding. This type of mounding needs to be added to the north property line as well. The mounding should be extended to the east to screen the future parking area. Also, Staff recommends the applicant use a variety of deciduous and evergreen trees rather than all evergreens.

Additional landscaping should be added to the front yard. Staff recommends the applicant landscape at the entry points and place a landscaped sign area on the Liberty Street edge of the detention area. This will screen the catch basin shown in the front yard.

The required parking for the development is 104 parking spaces, 111 are shown with 6 being handicap. The handicap ramps do not meet ADA standards and will need to be revised. Staff recommends the applicant make the entire sidewalk in front of the handicap spaces a ramp. The applicant should contact the Assistant City Engineer to discuss this matter.

The City Engineer has no major issues with the preliminary engineering submitted, however the applicant will need to provide more detailed information to the City Engineer for his approval.

Overall Staff is in support of the Preliminary Development Plan for 450 North Liberty Street and recommends approval with the following conditions;

1. That the applicant work with Staff and Emil Slavik to resolve any outstanding architectural issues.
2. That materials and colors be approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission.
3. That the HVAC vents be removed from the front elevation and the fence screen around the mechanicals be replaced with a brick wall.
4. That the applicant investigate using a smaller satellite dish and better screen the dish on all four sides.
5. That the applicant investigate using roll-out containers, including the possibility of enlarging the accessory building to allow for their storage.
6. That mounding be added to the north property line.
7. That the mounding use a variety of forms with breaks in the mounding rather than the single straight mound shown.
8. That the mounding be extended to the east to screen the future parking area.
9. That landscaping be added at the entry points and a landscaped sign area be shown on the Liberty Street edge of the front detention area.
10. That a monument sign plan be submitted and approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission.
11. That a mix of deciduous and evergreen trees be used for screening along the north, south, east property lines.
12. That the applicant work with the City Engineer to address any engineering issues.

SKETCH PLAN

Applicant: Newbury Homes
Location: 10331/10571/10441 Sawmill Road
Zoning: PR, Planned Residence District
Request: Review of Proposed Condominium Development with 18 Two-Unit Buildings on 10.4 acres

The subject property was part of the original annexation of 65 acres that included Lakes of Powell Sections 1-4 and the Tyler Run Elementary School site. At the time of the annexation and zoning in 1996, the property was placed in the PR, Planned Residence District as a church site under as the site had already been partially developed for the church. Church membership has declined over the years, so they would like to sell a portion of their property. Newbury Homes has submitted a plan for a condominium development that includes 18 two unit buildings, for a total of 36 dwelling units. Access to the site is provided from Sawmill Road, which will be the only way into and out of the development. The remainder of the church property will remain a church with the parking lots redeveloped as shown on the concept plan.

The property totals 16.454 acres. The site area for the condominiums is 10.4 acres, so the residual for the church is about 6 acres. The density of the proposed condominium development is 3.46 dwelling units per acre. This is the net density of the subject 10.4 acre tract. As a comparison, the Lakes of Powell Section 1-4 net density is 3.56 dwelling units per acre. Surrounding land uses include Zion Drive and Woods of Sawmill subdivision (1.8 du/ac net) to the north, Lakes of Powell to the east, Wedgewood Place subdivision to the south, the Zion Church and Sawmill Business Park to the west. There are also two existing homes fronting Sawmill Road on either side of the entrance, one of which is in very poor condition.

The property is well suited for residential development, being adjacent to existing subdivisions. It will be important to determine the proper density and housing type for this property. The applicant is proposing to build two unit condominiums. The buildings are one story plans utilizing stone and vinyl siding as exterior materials. Each unit has two bedrooms, a den or spare bedroom, two baths and a screened in porch. Except for the proposed vinyl siding, the buildings are nice looking. Condominium developments have been popular in this area and have sold quickly.

Staff studied the property for possible single family development (see plan in packet). The only possible scenario is to have a cul-de-sac developed off of Sawmill Road and curve around to utilize the entire property. A retention pond open space area can also be preserved. This scenario would create 30 single family home sites with the same lot sizes within the Lakes of Powell.

Comparing both plans, Staff prefers the proposed condominium concept for several reasons. The property is sort of a transitional piece between existing single family residential uses and the commercial and office to the west side of Sawmill Road. The proposed condominium layout actually would provide for more green area, and the units can be laid out to provide for more buffer and fewer units backing to the most affected subdivision Lakes of Powell. There is an existing stand of trees at the northeast corner of the site that can be better preserved with the condominium layout than the single family layout.

There are several concerns Staff has with the initial submission that can be changed and still provide for a developable plan:

- The south end of the project seems to be jammed with buildings, so much so that makes the southwestern most unit having to face the side of the building to the east. The buildings proposed at the southeast portion of the site are the ones located closest to the Lakes of Powell. Staff recommends the removal of one building, and that area be revised as shown on the plan included in the packet. This creates a greater buffer to the east, the side of the building faces Lakes of Powell and Wedgewood Place. When this area is redesigned, the applicant should provide as much buffer as possible to the east and south.

- The building on the north side of the site back up to Zion Drive and have a very short setback. We believe the setback should be 30 feet. However, there will be a need to provide stormwater retention on the site. Therefore, when the applicant proceeds with engineering, they should site these buildings as far as can be set back from Zion Drive.
- The buildings are nice looking, however we recommend the use of wood or cement-fiber siding rather than vinyl siding. Also, we were wondering if there can be some differences designed into the fronts of the buildings so that it is not as much of a cookie-cutter design. We also recommend the possibility of additional windows placed on the rear elevation, possibly within the bathrooms of the dwellings.
- A pathway is shown to connect to Zion Drive. A pathway easement along Sawmill Road should also be provided.
- The name of the development needs to be revised from "The Retreat at Powell." The City of Powell already has The Retreat subdivision on the northeast side.

This development will require the removal and reconfiguration of the existing church parking lot. Although detailed parking information is not required, it is expected the provided parking will be less than required by the zoning code. Staff has no concerns with providing less parking than required, provided there are enough spaces for the current congregation and foreseeable future membership expansion. Several future parking expansion areas are noted on the site plan.

Overall, Staff feels this is a workable plan and could fit in nicely with the community if the issues above can be properly addressed. This item should be taken to the Preliminary Development Plan stage.

COMBINED PRELIMINARY AND FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Applicant: Powell Realty
Location: 285 South Liberty Street
Zoning: PC, Planned Commercial District, Historic District Overlay District
Request: Approval of a Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan for a 5,084 square feet Office Building

Since the Sketch Plan discussion, the applicant has had this proposal reviewed by the Historic District Commission. The primary issue of concern was the square footage of the building. After a lengthy discussion the Commission recommended support of the proposed 5,000 square feet building back to the Planning and Zoning Commission with a 4-2 vote. Although in the Historic District Overlay, it should be noted that this property is zoned Planned Commercial which does not have a 3,000 square feet cap on building size like the Old Powell Commercial Zoning, which is typically found in the downtown vicinity. However, the building must be kept in character with the Historic District.

The applicant has reduced the width of the shared access drive from the proposed 30 feet to 20 feet. This will require the existing parallel handicap parking space at 271 South Liberty Street to be made a head-in space off the access drive. The existing handicap space is a legal non-conforming parking space as the current zoning code does not allow parking areas to be located in a required front yard. To allow the proposed handicap space at 271 would be a divergence from the zoning code. On the 285 South Liberty property, the applicant has shown two alternatives for the handicap parking. One alternative is to have a space similar to that proposed at 271 with the handicap entrance at the front of the building; this would also be a divergence from the zoning code. The other is to place the space at the rear, which creates a serpentine ramp for access to the rear. In this case, Staff has no concerns if the handicap spaces are placed at the front of the buildings but recommends the access drive be 22 feet wide for convenience and safety.

The parking requirement for 4,072 square feet of office space, as defined in the 1149.06 and 1149.07(b)(18) of the Planning and Zoning Code, is 21 parking spaces including one handicap. Depending on the handicap space location the parking provided is 19, with rear handicap parking, or 21, with front handicap parking. The applicant is requesting a divergence of the landscaped

parking bay requirement. Typically, no more than 8 spaces are permitted side-by-side without adding a landscape bay. The applicant is requesting 10 in a row of 16 before adding a double landscape bay. The divergence is for location rather than for quantity. Staff has no concerns with this divergence as the proposed location of the bay creates a better view looking down the access drive from Liberty Street. The applicant is showing a future 4 space expansion of the 271 South Liberty parking area. The Historic District Commission previously approved this expansion.

There are several divergences being requested for the building location. The front setback is shown at 60 feet, the rear at 70 feet, the north side at 25 feet, and the south side at 15 feet. The south side setback is a divergence from the required 25 feet setback in the PC District. Typical side setbacks for commercial structures in the Historic District vary from 5 to 15 feet. The applicant is also requesting a divergence from 50 feet to 40 feet for building separation from the existing structure on 271 South Liberty Street. Staff has no concerns with the divergences requested. As is common in traditional design and site layout, many buildings in the Historic District are set closer to the property lines, streets, and other buildings than this proposal.

The applicant has verbally agreed to extend the bikepath from 271 South Liberty to the south property line of 285 as shown in the Master Bikeway Plan. The City will connect to this extension when Black Oak Park to the south is improved. A walk connecting to the bikepath should be shown on the south side of the access drive. This will provide a connection to both properties.

The applicant still needs to obtain approval from the Historic District Commission for the design of the structure. Overall, the Commission was satisfied with the attempt made to break the massing of the building and the initial design sketches. The large front porch is a new addition to the building but Staff feels it is a great asset to the proposal. Staff will relay any architectural comments of the Commission to the HDC.

Engineering issues need to be worked through. Staff does not foresee any issues that would jeopardize the proposal. Also, a detailed landscape plan was not submitted. The applicant has provided a general plan. Staff recommends some additional plantings be added around the parking areas.

Staff recommends approval of the Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan for 285 South Liberty Street, with the following conditions;

1. That landscaping be added around the parking areas.
2. That a detailed landscaping plan be submitted and approved by Staff.
3. That the bikepath be extended from 271 South Liberty Street to the south property line of 285 South Liberty Street.
4. That a walkway be added to the south side of the access drive to connect the proposed walkways with the bikepath.
5. That the applicant obtain approval of all engineering work from the City Engineer.

COMBINED PRELIMINARY AND FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Applicant: William and Pouneh Alcott, Village Academy School
Location: 284 South Liberty Street
Zoning: OPPCR, Old Powell Planned Commercial/Residential District, Historic District Overlay District
Request: Approval of a Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan for a 10,882 square feet Fine Arts Facility and to Allow Submission of a Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan

This item was approved at the last meeting to proceed with a Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan. No changes have been made with the plans since the Sketch Plan. The proposal received very favorable comments as reflected in the minutes from the last meeting.

The Village Academy School has gone back to the drawing board and has totally revised their plans from what was submitted last year. They have an agreement to acquire additional property

that squares off their north property line and gives them the ability to put their Fine Arts Facility into one building behind the existing residential homes along Liberty Street rather than beside them. The building as proposed reflects the rural nature of the area by resembling a barn. As shown on the plans, this structure has both one-story and two-story elements, and is set back from the west and north property lines 25 feet. This setback does vary from the required 50 feet side yard and 60 feet rear yard established in the OPPCR zoning district.

No additional parking is proposed. The applicant has indicated a parking requirement breakdown on the plans. However, they are incorrect in their analysis. The following analysis should be utilized (this is the "total occupancy" scenario):

Combined Elementary & High/Middle School

11 elem. classes	x	4 spaces per class	=	44 spaces
Approximate Staff - 39 (other than elem. teachers)			=	39 spaces
280 High School Students	x	1 space per 10 students	=	28 spaces
Assembly Area (Gymnasium)			=	<u>75 spaces</u>
		TOTAL REQUIRED		186 spaces
		TOTAL EXISTING		134 spaces
		TOTAL VARIANCE		52 spaces

With day to day use of the school, Staff has not observed any parking problems with the lot as it is configured. During special events, however, there are some times when parking becomes an issue. During these events, the applicant has indicated in previous meetings that they utilize parking at the pre-school in Wolf Commerce Park and bus people to this site. This should be a required practice as no further parking areas are to be developed. Staff has studied this situation over the last few weeks and find that there are no existing day-to-day problems.

No landscaping plan has been submitted. This will be needed prior to the submission of this plan before Council. The applicant has indicated that code requirements for landscaping will be met. Special attention should be paid to the west and north sides of the proposed building.

These plans will need to be reviewed by the Historic District Commission. The applicant has consulted with the architectural advisor to the HDC, and has already incorporated his suggestions into these plans.

Staff recommends approval of the Combined Preliminary and Final Development Plan with the following conditions:

1. That a landscape plan be submitted and approved by the Commission prior to Council action of the development plan.
2. That a lighting plan be submitted to address concerns about lights shining onto adjacent properties.
3. That the Historic District Commission approve the architecture of the building.
4. That additional stormwater requirements be met and approved by the City Engineer.
5. That the required landscaping from previous development plans be reviewed by staff and planted or replanted by the applicant.

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

Applicant: Fiori Homes
Location: Northwest Corner of Liberty Road and Seldom Seen Road
Zoning: PR, Planned Residence District
Request: Administrative Review of Minor Modifications to the Location of the Clubhouse for the Village at Powell

The applicant is requesting to modify the location of the clubhouse and parking area layout for the Village at Powell condominium development. From the best Staff can determine, dimensions were not provided on the Final Development Plan, the clubhouse will increase slightly in size from

about 2,500 to 2,638 square feet. This modification will also correct a poorly designed parking area design. Instead of a circular entrance and exit, this proposal will use the main entrance from Liberty Street for access with head-in parking. Overall there is a loss of paved area and subsequent increase in green space. Staff supports this modification and recommends approval.

OTHER BUSINESS

Re-dedication of Grace Drive

The City has prepared a plat document to be filed with the Delaware County Recorder. Basically, this document follows-up the roadway improvement based upon the right-of-way acquisition that was conducted. This plat is recording the right-of-way for Grace Drive in one document. That way, the right-of-way and parcel data for the project is properly reflected on the County's mapping system.

The Commission is required to approve this document in order for it to be recorded. Staff recommends approval subject to the approval of the City Engineer.

