



STAFF REPORT
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION
Powell Village Green
June 9, 2004
7:30 P.M.

PRELIMINARY DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Applicant: Village Communities, The Traditions of Powell
Location: North Side of West Olentangy Street adjacent to the east of Village Pointe Shopping Center
Zoning: PC, Planned Commercial District
Request: Approval of a Preliminary Development Plan for a mixed use development on 6.1 acres consisting of 40 townhouse condominiums, a future 5,200 square feet restaurant, and a 6,000 square feet office

****In an effort to combine the residential and commercial portions of this development into a unified plan, the applicant submitted site plans and building elevations for the restaurant and office uses late Friday. Staff will review these submittals and provide a supplement to this report prior to the meeting.****

The subject property has been marketed for some time. The applicant has the property in contract and proposes to build a mixed-use development to include a restaurant and office toward the front of the property along West Olentangy Street and 40 condominium townhomes in four unit buildings. The proposed restaurant is one that is looking to possibly relocate within the City, La Tavola.

This application was reviewed as a Sketch Plan in February 2004. At that meeting the primary concerns of the Commission dealt with density, number of units per building, traffic impact on Case and Lincoln, and design. All of these items have been addressed since that meeting.

The property is currently zoned PC, Planned Commercial District, and the proposed uses are permitted uses within this district. The property is also within the Historic District Overlay zone, so the development should, and does, reflect one that is laid out in a manner consistent with the downtown area in terms of architecture and site layout. With that, this plan is attempting to place the restaurant and office buildings along West Olentangy Street and the townhomes being laid out utilizing rear garages and facing a street designed to create a neighborhood feel. Also, the plan is being conscious of the fact that it faces three streets (West Olentangy, West Case Ave, and Lincoln Street) in that the commercial and residential buildings are built facing those streets.

The main entry to the site is via a new private street, Traditions Way, off of West Olentangy Street and shared with the Cordi property to the east. Staff is attempting to contact Mr. Cordi to discuss the shared access, traffic improvements (discussed later), and his contribution to the improvements. Traditions Way heads north into the site and makes an S-curve around the open space/retention pond turning north again through the residential area of the development and connecting with West Case. A secondary cross access easement is being proposed through the Village Pointe Shopping Center. The applicant has not shown sufficient information for surrounding properties to be able to address this access as well other issues. Staff is in support of the cross access proposal as it provides accessibility to a traffic signal at Village Pointe Drive and West Olentangy Street pending the applicant shows how this proposal interacts with surrounding properties. However, it is Staff's understanding that this cross access proposal is not desired by the owner's of Village Pointe.

The applicant has submitted a traffic study that contemplates traffic volumes for this site and the Cordi property during PM peak hour traffic (5:00-6:00pm). It states ODOT warrants are met for an eastbound left turn lane on West Olentangy Street. The study also examined impacts on Case, Lincoln, and the cross access with Village Pointe. While some will take advantage of these access points, it is predicted the traffic volume and impact is minimal at peak hour. With the turn lanes required as part of the Powell Junction plan, to the east on the south side of Olentangy Street, Staff needs to re-examine the overall road design of West Olentangy Street from the CSX Railroad to Village Pointe Drive/Murphy Parkway. Staff will meet with the City Engineer prior to the meeting to discuss what improvements will be required with this plan. Since this is a shared drive directly benefiting the

Cordi property, there is a need to create an agreement with all parties in order to make this happen. Staff fully supports access management in this manner.

The site plan proposes extending the streetscape, with parallel parking, along the front of this site on West Olentangy Street. While this effort is certainly appreciated and necessary, Staff needs to evaluate the value and impact of parallel parking along West Olentangy Street considering the possibility of requiring a left turn lane. With the Powell Junction plan parallel spaces were discouraged by the City Engineer due to the proximity to the railroad. In similar discussions with the City Engineer regarding the Cordi property Sketch Plan, parallel parking spaces were also discouraged. While some type of streetscape similar to the Villagescape Plan is appropriate and will be required, Staff needs to determine whether or not parallel parking should be a part of this. Until more detailed discussions are held with the City Engineer, the initial thought is not to include the parallel spaces. Staff will work with the applicant to address the traffic improvements and streetscape design issues. At the very least the asphalt path along Olentangy Street should be made into a concrete walk with a decorative design similar to the Villagescape in front of the Sonrise Coffee House and that to be included in the 3 Pillar Homes 50 South Liberty Street project.

From Traditions Way, access is provided to the future restaurant and office sites. The restaurant use is located at the corner of Traditions Way and West Olentangy Street with the office being immediately west. Although a layout is shown for both uses, these will be approved with separate development plans. The uses, building areas, and fact the sites can be planned to meet the requirements of the Zoning Code are important. The applicant is proposing a front setback along West Olentangy Street of 20 feet. This a divergence from the required 60 feet in the PC District. The setbacks established in the PC District are for suburban designed development which this is not. In the Old Powell Commercial District along Olentangy Street front setbacks are 20 feet. Also, this is consistent with the commercial buildings on the north side of West Olentangy Street, west of the railroad. Staff supports the divergence request.

With respect to the commercial portion of this plan Staff has two comments at this time. Traditions Way from Olentangy Street through the commercial area needs to be given more of a streetscape appearance with landscaping and perhaps picket fencing, benches, etc. Also, the linkage between the commercial and residential area needs to be stronger. In a traditional neighborhood development, a mix of uses and the linkages between the uses is necessary. Unlike a typical suburban development where the uses are separated and buffered, this encourages interaction between the uses. This can be done by enhancing the pedestrian link coming through the center of the commercial sites. A good example of this is the 3 Pillar Homes 50 South Liberty Plan. Staff will work with the applicant and future applicants for the commercial sites to address these issues.

Several changes have been made to the residential portion of the plan. The biggest changes include the reduction in the number of units from 48 to 40 and the removal of all 6 and 8 unit buildings. All buildings are now 4 unit buildings. The resulting density for the residential area is 9.26 du/ac. In the PC District, a maximum density is not provided. The applicant states Section 1143.09(c)(10)(A) sets the maximum density is 9 du/ac and is requesting a divergence of 0.26 du/ac. That is not accurate. The referenced Section states that if more than one acre or more than 9 dwelling units per acre are provided that portion of the development in the PC District shall be designated as a Planned Residence, PR, District and meet those requirements. In the PR District a maximum density of 9 du/ac is permitted for other than single-family/two-family dwellings. The applicant is in fact requesting a divergence but from Section 1143.13(a) in the PR regulations.

This is certainly higher than a typical Powell subdivision. However, this area is part of the downtown where higher densities are found and recommended by the Downtown Revitalization Plan. As was discussed in February, these densities are necessary to provide the critical mass necessary to support the traditional mixed use type of development of downtown. They are also appropriate considering the housing style and site design incorporated with this traditional development. While this density is high, consider the following net densities recently approved for condominium projects in the City under the PR District zoning,

1. Villages at Powell – 4.97 du/ac net
2. Villages at Murphy Park – 5.58 du/ac net
3. Woods at Big Bear Farms – 5.30 du/ac net

These densities were approved in typical “suburban” subdivisions. With that in mind as well as the level of detail being placed in the building design, streetscape design (both interior to the site and along public rights-of-way),

and general development as a traditional neighborhood, Staff feels this density and the divergence(s) is very much appropriate.

The applicant has taken into consideration many of the suggestions offered by Staff and the Commission at the Sketch Plan in revising the site layout and design. Overall it is very good. All buildings front a public or private street. Traditions Way will incorporate a streetscape similar in design to that of the Villagescape. No changes are shown for West Case or Lincoln other than a sidewalk. Staff is considering to what extent a streetscape should be included on these streets given the traffic issues discussed, and the improvements to Case Avenue and Lincoln Street as part of this development. The inclusion of a sidewalk and some type of lighting will be required at minimum.

The interior residential flow is for the most part good. Traditions Way is shown at 20 feet in width. With parallel parking and the main street through the development this needs to be a minimum of 22 feet. The two buildings near the intersection of Case and Lincoln are proposed to share a garage (the northernmost Lincoln has a garage attached to the easternmost Case building's garage). Although this is acceptable, turning movements seem to be difficult. Staff feels a better solution is to allow a two four car garages that are placed behind the Lincoln building facing west. This allows easier movement in and out of the garages. Staff will work with the applicant and HDC to address this matter. Staff would also suggest moving the access drive to the west alley south to align with the access to the east alley. This will centrally locate the west alley access and give a better appearance of a traditional grid street network.

A number of dimensional divergences are requested for the condominiums. The required yard setbacks are 60 feet for the front, 10 feet for the sides, and 40 feet for the rear. A minimum building separation of 10 feet is required and met with this application. The applicant proposes setbacks of 20 feet from public rights-of-way, 25 feet from interior property lines, and 10 feet building separation. The first building north of the office use parking area is proposed at three feet from the property line. As shown, the parking area is setback 3 feet from the property line leaving 6 feet of green space between the parking area and the porch of the condominium. The office parking will be planned with a separate application. While 3 feet is close, with proper landscaping this can be acceptable for this type of development. Additionally, it may be possible to remove that row of parking, or at least several spaces, depending on the final building area and parking requirement for the commercial use. The applicant should address the landscaping with a detailed landscaping plan submitted with the Final Development Plan. These setbacks and separations are consistent with the zoning districts found in the Historic District. Staff is in support of these divergences.

Five areas of open space are incorporated throughout the site as common open space. Section 1143.09(c)(4)(A) requires a minimum of 20% common open space. In this application 13.4% of the area is set aside as common open space. Typically in a traditional neighborhood, open space is provided with a centrally located public park. Good examples of this are the Victorian Village/Short North with Goodale Park and the German Village/Merion Village with Schiller Park. The Powell comparable is the downtown with the Village Green. Reserves 1 and 2 are open space with retention ponds and Reserves 3, 4, and 5 are tree preservation areas. The tree preservation reserves are helpful in screening drive aisles and the sides of buildings along Case and Lincoln. The retention pond reserves offer an excellent opportunity for the applicant to provide public amenities for the neighborhood. By incorporating walkways, benches, picnic areas, a gazebo, or other elements, these two reserves can be an asset. Staff can work with the applicant to incorporate these elements at the time of final engineering and the pond sizes are set. With the provision of these amenities, Staff is in support of this divergence.

In the Historic District the HDC will address architectural design issues. Just as the HDC has an opportunity to make recommendations to this Commission regarding site design and layout, this Commission can make recommendations to the HDC regarding architecture. The HDC has had opportunity review this proposal but not as an application before them (Concept Review is June 17). For the most part they were very receptive to the architecture shown in this application. Several items of concern dealt with the following,

1. The garage design was not submitted. Elevation drawings are included with this submittal.
2. There were general concerns with the screen porch design. Although it was not discussed to any detail at the meeting, a suggestion was include permanent windows rather than the cookie cutter screen porch seen in other condo developments.
3. Several did not like the blank wall on the front porch elevation and suggested a window be added. At the time a floor plan was not submitted, but it appears this request can be fulfilled as a hallway dead ends at this wall.

4. Although the overall design was very much appreciated, there were concerns, especially in subsequent discussions with the Architectural Advisor, with the appearance of this being a cookie cutter development and how to best avoid it. Some potential solutions are to vary the exterior materials, colors, window styles, door styles, and other architectural features. This would allow the building footprints and window/door fenestrations to remain the same. The other, more drastic, solution is to design several buildings to be incorporated in the development. This would be similar to the Homestead Communities development at Scioto Reserve and in New Albany along Morse Road east of Hamilton. Staff would be in support of either solution but the first solution is the most logical given the economics of offering homes in the \$170,000 range.

The applicant has provided typical streetscape elevations, a general landscape plan, and a fencing plan. Overall the streetscape is good. The walkways need to be a minimum of 5 feet in width and the colonial lighting fixture shown is not appropriate. The applicant should consider a fixture similar in design to that used in the Villagescape. Also it is not clear where the lighting fixtures are to be placed. They should be placed at regular intervals from Oientangy through to Case.

With the previous comments regarding streetscape design along Traditions Way, Case, and Lincoln, the landscaping plan appears appropriate at this time. Planting lists and typical building/unit plantings will be provided at the Final Development Plan. Two landscaping divergences are requested. The first is that with the wooded nature of the site it is not possible to replace trees that are removed due to construction. The applicant states that a majority of the trees are Ash trees in poor condition and susceptible to the emerald ash borer. Staff has not had an opportunity to walk the site and examine tree condition. While the emerald ash borer does pose a threat to Ash trees in the area, the ODNR is actively attempting to contain the insect in the Easton/Morse Road area where it has been located in central Ohio. It may or may not reach Powell. If the trees are in poor condition replacement is not required. Staff will comment on this further at the Final Development Plan and after a tree survey has been submitted. The second divergence requested is to allow only 40% of the building perimeter to be landscaped rather than the 70% required. The applicant states that patios and walkways make fulfilling the requirement difficult. Staff is opposed to this request and feels the walkways and patios can be held away from the building to allow a landscape bed along the foundation perimeter. This will create a much better aesthetic for the buildings.

The applicant is proposing to use a mix of picket and privacy fences. It is difficult to distinguish the fence locations and different fence types from the site plan. A separate fencing plan should be submitted to clarify this matter. Staff is not opposed to the use of privacy fences so long as they do exceed five feet in height as required by code and do not obstruct the view across any front, side, or rear yard. Around patios and decks fence heights are permitted to be six feet in height by code.

Although the applicant has shown a preliminary storm water management system, calculations have not been provided for the City Engineer to review. This property is a part of the Murphy Park Stormwater Master Plan and has a fairly restrictive release rate. It is important the applicant demonstrate prior to the Final Development Plan that the stormwater can be adequately stored on-site.

Overall Staff is excited about the opportunity to bring new residential opportunities to the downtown area as well the ability to keep very well known and respected restaurant in the City. This is a good plan that needs to work out some of the final details. Staff recommends approval of the Preliminary Development Plan for the Traditions of Powell with the following conditions,

1. That the applicant submit a site plan showing surrounding properties in a level of detail as required to make sound planning and engineering decisions for this development.
2. That the applicant work with Staff to address the recommendations in the submitted Traffic Study and any traffic improvements recommended by Staff. These recommendations shall be shown on the Final Development Plan.
3. That the applicant work with Staff to address the appropriate streetscape to include on the public rights-of-way adjacent to this development and interior to this site. The final streetscape design shall be shown on the Final Development Plan.
4. That a well defined pedestrian link between the residential and commercial areas be provided. The 3 Pillar Homes 50 South Liberty Street proposed development can be used as an example.
5. That the residential area be designated as PR, Planned Residence District, and subject to the requirements of that district expect where divergences are approved.

6. That two, four car garages placed behind the Lincoln Street condominium building is permitted to alleviate difficult turning movements. The applicant shall work with the HDC on the design.
7. That Traditions Way be a minimum of 22 feet in width.
8. That the applicant work with Staff to provide public amenities such as walkways, benches, picnic areas, a gazebo, or other elements deemed necessary to make Reserves 1 and 2 functional open spaces for the residents of this development.
9. That all interior walkways be shown at a minimum of five feet in width.
10. That the colonial street lighting fixture is inappropriate for the Historic District and another lighting fixture be approved by the HDC. A fixture similar to that found in the Villagescape is preferred.
11. That a detailed landscaping plan and tree survey be submitted with the Final Development Plan.
12. That a separate fencing plan be submitted with the Final Development Plan. No privacy fence shall be taller than five feet in height, except around patios and decks, as required by code and no privacy fence shall obstruct the view across any front, side, or rear yard.
13. That the applicant work with the City Engineer to demonstrate stormwater can be adequately managed on-site.

FINAL PLAT

Applicant: Bauer, Davidson, and Merchant, Inc
 Location: Northeast corner of Sawmill Parkway and Seldom Seen Road
 Zoning: PC, Planned Commercial District
 Request: Approval of Golf Village Commercial Section 1 Final Plat for 11 commercial lots on 50.718 acres with 22.735 acres to be dedicated as open space

This section is known as sub-area G of the Golf Village Development Plan. It is designed as a typical suburban retail center with a large, center anchor lot with outlots fronting the main public thoroughfares. Future development will include retail and consumer service uses. Presently three child daycares, a retail center, two restaurants, and a car wash/oil change are proposed for sites within this section. The interior streets are all privately maintained. The eastern half of this section is designated open space that will be dedicated to a public entity. As part of the Golf Village Development Plan, this open space was to be dedicated to Liberty Township. The City has been working with the developer to have the open space dedicated to the City. The open, flat nature of the land makes it a prime opportunity for much needed athletic fields.

To the south of this section is another commercial area, Seldom Seen Acres (Liberty Township), to the north is the Centex portion of Golf Village and Rutherford Estates subdivision, and to the west are the Stonebridge condominiums.

The number of lots, their layout and size all meet the requirements of the Golf Village development plan. In reviewing a development plan for Section 2, Staff has encountered a situation in which it is necessary to add more land to an outlot in order to allow for proper vehicular movement through the site. Staff requests the ability to make lot line adjustments as necessary provided all requirements of the Golf Village Development Plan and Liberty Township Zoning Resolution are met. Staff recommends approval of the Final Plat for Golf Village Commercial Section 1 with the following conditions,

1. That the Plat meets the requirements of the City Engineer for all easements, lot numbers, addresses and any other item that he deems appropriate.
2. That the open space shown on lot 12 be dedicated to the City of Powell.
3. That Staff is permitted to adjust lot lines as necessary as long as such adjustments meet all requirements of the Golf Village Development Plan and the Liberty Township Zoning Resolution.

FINAL PLAT

Applicant: Bauer, Davidson, and Merchant, Inc
 Location: Southeast corner of Sawmill Parkway and Home Road
 Zoning: PC, Planned Commercial District
 Request: Approval of Golf Village Commercial Section 2 Final Plat for 7 commercial lots on 25.544 acres

This section is known as sub-area F of the Golf Village Development Plan. Like Section 1 it also designed as a typical suburban retail center with a large, center anchor lot with outlots fronting the main public thoroughfares. Future development will include retail and consumer service uses. Presently a bank and gas station with a convenience store and pizza restaurant are proposed for sites within this section. The interior streets are all privately maintained.

To the south are the Villas at Woodcutter condominiums, to the north is a mix of agricultural, residential, and industrial uses, to east the Planned Industrial area of Golf Village (self-storage and office warehouse uses), and to the west is sub-area E which will be office uses. The property to the north of this section is presently for sale and is pending rezoning and development plan approval in Liberty Township. It will include the extension of Sawmill Parkway. The future northeast corner of Sawmill Parkway and Home Road is proposed to be a commercial development very similar to the design and layout of this section.

The number of lots, their layout and size all meet the requirements of the Golf Village development plan. Staff is presently reviewing the development plan for the gas station/convenience store/pizza restaurant. In the review process, it has been determined the developer will need more land than proposed and shown on this plat. Staff requests the ability to allow adjustments in the lot lines to make such accommodations. Staff recommends approval of the Final Plat for Golf Village Commercial Section 1 with the following conditions,

1. That the Plat meets the requirements of the City Engineer for all easements, lot numbers, addresses and any other item that he deems appropriate.
2. That Staff is permitted to adjust lot lines as necessary as long as such adjustments meet all requirements of the Golf Village Development Plan and the Liberty Township Zoning Resolution.

FINAL PLAT

Applicant: R.D. Zande & Associates
Location: 5.125 acres on the north side of Rutherford Road between Sawmill Parkway and the CSX Railroad, surrounded by Golf Village Section 4 subdivision
Zoning: PR, Planned Residence District
Request: Approval of Golf Village Section 4 Phase C Final Plat for 3 residential lots on 5.306 acres with 4.109 acres of open space

This section of Golf Village includes the three lots and open space recently approved by the Commission for Centex Homes. This parcel was previously part of Liberty Township and zoned Industrial with residential lots of Golf Village surrounding it. These three lots are infill lots along Trail Lake Drive. The remaining 4.109 acres will be retained as open space by the homeowners association. This entire section is surrounded by Golf Village and Centex home sites.

The number of lots, their layout and size all meet the requirements of the approved Final Development Plan. Staff recommends approval of the Final Plat for Golf Village Section 4 Phase C with the following conditions,

1. That the Plat meets the requirements of the City Engineer for all easements, lot numbers, addresses and any other item that he deems appropriate.